Hidden Persuaders: Do Small Gifts Lubricate Business Negotiations?

Michel André Maréchal and Christian Thöni

May 4, 2018

Online Appendix

Contents

Α	Additional Tables	2
в	Instructions and data sheet	6

A Additional Tables

	(1)	(2)
Dependent variable:	Negotiation duration	# offers shown
Gift	0.498	0.239
	(0.639)	(0.191)
Constant	15.024***	4.484***
	(2.534)	(0.533)
Controls?		
Agent FE	yes	yes
Agent time trend	yes	yes
Customer category FE	yes	yes
Time of day FE	yes	yes
Day of week FE	yes	yes
Week FE	yes	yes
Observations	220	220
R^2	0.736	0.207
F	20.141	4.409
p	0.000	0.000

Table A1: Do sales agents provide more effort in the gift condition?

This table reports OLS coefficient estimates (robust standard errors in parentheses). The dependent variable in column (1) is the total duration of the sales negotiation in minutes. In column (2), the dependent variable indicates how many of the five special offers were shown to the purchasing agent during the negotiations. "Gift" is a dummy variable for treatment Gift. All regressions include sales agent specific linear time trends and fixed effects for customer categories B to E (as a proxy for sales potential), time of the day, day of the week and calendar week. Significance levels are denoted as follows: * p < 0.10, ** p < 0.05, *** p < 0.01.

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Dependent variable:	Dental pr	oducts	Other pro	oducts
Gift	14.651 (9.460)	4.260 (8.181)	$43.790^{**} \\ (20.275)$	$-5.805 \ (20.387)$
Gift \times manager		30.187 (29.788)		145.638^{**} (59.626)
Manager		12.351 (13.229)		27.141 (29.347)
Constant	$15.793 \\ (29.398)$	$13.794 \\ (27.664)$	224.871 (147.337)	$223.595 \\ (137.221)$
Controls?				
Agent FE	yes	yes	yes	yes
Agent time trend	yes	yes	yes	yes
Customer category FE	yes	yes	yes	yes
Time of day FE	yes	yes	yes	yes
Day of week FE	yes	yes	yes	yes
Week FE	yes	yes	yes	yes
Observations	220	220	220	220
R^2	0.166	0.200	0.224	0.294
F	7.300	2.982	2.156	2.138
p	0.000	0.000	0.001	0.001

Table A2: Treatment effects for dental products and other products

This table reports OLS coefficient estimates (robust standard errors in parentheses). The dependent variable in columns (1) and (2) is the sales revenue for dental products only. In columns (3) and (4), the dependent variable is the total sales revenue for all other (non-dental) products. "Gift" is a dummy variable for treatment Gift. "Manager" is a dummy indicating that the sales rep negotiated with the store manager. The interaction term "Gift × manager" allows the treatment effect to differ between negotiations with the store managers and regular staff. All regressions include sales agent specific linear time trends and fixed effects for customer categories B to E (as a proxy for sales potential), time of the day, day of the week and calendar week. Significance levels are denoted as follows: * p < 0.10, ** p < 0.05, *** p < 0.01.

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)
Dependent variable:		Sales r	evenue in Sw	iss francs	
Panel A					
Gift	-12.714	89.040	119.083^{*}	24.925	103.600
	(13.312)	(87.812)	(59.984)	(35.435)	(130.822)
Panel B					
Gift \times manager	-33.167	241.625	181.273	172.286**	556.500**
	(19.171)	(239.959)	(135.820)	(85.882)	(151.989)
Gift	6.167	2.375	38.458	-31.119	-119.000
	(6.766)	(7.605)	(36.221)	(33.605)	(106.503)
Manager	27.000	-4.000	67.188	-43.500	-111.167
	(17.937)	(4.053)	(51.263)	(35.054)	(107.541)
Sales agent $\#$	1	2	3	4	5
Observations	13	50	89	58	10

Table A3: Treatment and interaction effects by individual sales agents

This table reports OLS coefficient estimates (robust standard errors in parentheses) for each sales agent seperately. The dependent variable is the total sales revenue generated during the negotiation. "Gift" is a dummy variable for treatment Gift. "Manager" is a dummy indicating that the sales rep negotiated with the store manager. The interaction term "Gift × manager" allows the treatment effect to differ between negotiations with the store managers and regular staff. Due to the low number of observation for some of the sales agents we do not include additional control variables. Significance levels are denoted as follows: * p < 0.10, ** p < 0.05, *** p < 0.01.

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Dependent variable:		Sales revenue in	Swiss francs	
Gift	130.913^{***}	119.971^{***}	47.769	23.319
	(48.984)	(42.001)	(50.501)	(30.001)
Gift \times first visit	-146.891^{***} (50.397)	-154.293^{***} (56.098)	-111.632^{**} (49.839)	$-54.809 \ (46.522)$
First visit	$-24.531 \\ (31.586)$	5.876 (45.456)	$3.359 \\ (44.914)$	5.924 (44.326)
Gift \times manager			160.023^{**} (78.731)	220.088^{**} (99.583)
Manager			42.011 (38.757)	37.986 (38.132)
Gift \times manager \times first				-221.382^{**} (102.809)
Constant	27.047 (26.541)	$165.675 \\ (152.167)$	$183.276 \\ (143.776)$	$180.400 \\ (143.332)$
Controls?				
Agent FE	yes	yes	yes	yes
Agent time trend		yes	yes	yes
Customer category FE		yes	yes	yes
Time of day FE		yes	yes	yes
Day of week FE		yes	yes	yes
Week FE		yes	yes	yes
Observations	207	207	207	207
R^2	0.106	0.244	0.310	0.324
F	6.533	3.921	3.316	4.129
p	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000

Table A4: Is the first visit effect robust to excluding the newly hired sales agent?

This table reports OLS coefficient estimates (robust standard errors in parentheses). Observations from the newly hired sales representative are omitted from the sample. The dependent variable is the total sales revenue generated during the negotiation. "Gift" is a dummy variable for treatment Gift. "First visit" is a dummy indicating that the sales rep visited the purchasing agent for the first time. "Gift \times first visit", "Gift \times manager", and "Gift \times manager \times first" are the corresponding interaction terms. All regressions include sales agent fixed effects (FE). The regression in column (2) includes additional sales agent specific linear time trends and fixed effects for customer categories B to E (as a proxy for sales potential), time of the day, day of the week and calendar week. Significance levels are denoted as follows: * p < 0.10, ** p < 0.05, *** p < 0.01.

B Instructions and data sheet

Treatment instructions and data sheet, which was completed by the sales agents before and after each sales pitch (translated from German). The version shows the instructions for the Gift treatment; in the control treatment the text with the gray background replaced the first bullet point.

Ins	structions for sales pitch $\# 1$
	(Do not distribute any other gifts or free samples)
	• Do not hand over a gift.
	(Do not distribute any other gifts or free samples)
	• Show—if possible—all offers in the booklet (even if the customer shows little interest).
	Stick to the order of offers in the sales booklet.
Ple	ease answer the following questions <u>before</u> the sales pitch
0. I	dentification code:
1.	nformation about the drug store/pharmacy Name of the drug store/pharmacy: Address: Customer ID:
2. I	ndicate the customer category □ A-customer □ B-customer □ C-customer □ D-customer □ E-customer
3. \	When was the last time you visited this customer?
4. I	How often did you visit this customer since January 2005?
5. I	n which language region is the store located? □ German □ French/Italian
6. I	How is the weather? □ sunny □ cloudy □ rain or snowfall
7. I 8. /	ndicate the date of the visit

	minutes and the elasticities take to consider the oriels.
10.	Could you present all offers from the sales booklet?
	If not, which offer could you not show? \Box offer 1 \Box offer 2 \Box offer 3 \Box offer 4 \Box offer 5
11. wit	Please indicate the revenue you generated for each offer. In case you did not realize a sale offer 1 offer 2 offer 3 offer 4 offer 5
12.	What was the gender of your negotiation partner?
13.	Did you negotiate with the store manager?
14.	How likeable was the negotiation partner? □ very unlikable □ unlikeable □ neutral □ likeable □ very likeable
15.	Is the drug store/pharmacy located in a shopping mall? □ yes □ no
16.	Did you reach your personal goals for this meeting? □ yes □ no
17.	Further remarks
	L